



#### M E M O R A N D U M

#### **DATE:** July 11, 2022

- **TO:** Marty Hohenberger, Director, Center for Economic Development & Community Resilience, *Ohio University Voinovich School of Public Affairs*
- **FROM:** Kate Perani, Special Projects Manager RISE Ohio, *Buckeye Hills Regional Council* Matt O'Rourke, RISE Ohio Project Manager, *American Structurepoint, Inc.* Andy Clemens, Investigative Projects Manager, *American Structurepoint, Inc.*

#### CC: Samantha Miller, Development Director, Buckeye Hills Regional Council

#### RE: RISE Ohio Project Proposal: Putnam Commons Building Evaluation and Prospectus

#### **Overview**

The Putnam Commons Building in the City of Marietta, Ohio is an approximately 60,000 square-foot century-old commercial building with a long history as a downtown anchor of local economic activity. Over the years, this building has served as a saddle manufacturing facility, a JC Penney department store, and as medical office space. However, for the past several years the building has been mostly vacant and has gone through some ownership challenges. In addition, the block of Putnam Street the Putnam Commons building sits on is underinvested, perhaps due to the long-term vacancy of the Putnam Commons itself. The repurposing of Putnam Commons to productive use is thus critical to the downtown revitalization efforts of the City of Marietta and Washington County.

Putnam Commons is located within Opportunity Zone #0205, and is thus eligible for technical assistance under the RISE Ohio program. After consultation with the building owner, the City of Marietta, and the SE Ohio Port Authority, the technical assistance Buckeye Hills Regional Council proposes for American Structurepoint to provide for the owner of Putnam Commons will include:

- 1. A detailed report of current building conditions
- 2. An assessment of real estate market conditions in the surrounding area
- 3. Recommendations of creative and tested methods to maximize physical improvements to the building

This assistance described above will allow the owner of Putnam Commons to understand the structural needs of the building so that improvements can be made, better market their property to potential tenants, and/or demonstrate the building is worthy of outside investment/development. Thus, this project achieves the goal of the RISE Ohio program by increasing Opportunity Zone investment opportunities within the Buckeye Hills Region.

#### **Project Description**

American Structurepoint will deliver the following:

• Structurally assess Putnam Commons to identify recommended building and ADA accessibility

improvements

- Review overall structural condition, as well as building envelope, including windows, façade, and roofing, and derive high-level cost estimates for improvements
- Analyze existing market and building conditions to identify and prioritize improvements, including gathering rental and sales data for comparable buildings.
- Draft a prospectus that identifies potential adaptive reuses, based on financial analysis of possible rental streams and incorporating the construction estimates derived from the structural inspection, and including estimates of any public subsidy that may be required.

#### Scope of Work

#### Phase 1 – Analyzing Putnam Commons

- <u>Objective</u>: The analysis will examine the estimated costs of the recommended physical improvements to Putnam Commons.
- <u>Phase One Milestones:</u>
  - 1. Market Analysis: We will collect and analyze market data pertinent to the possible reuse of the structure, focusing on the potential to repay any loans necessary to rehabilitate the property, given reasonable assumptions on financing and public assistance. Rent data will be garnered from external sources and be used to populate a development proforma with a typical 10-year analysis window.
  - 2. Physical assessment of Putnam Commons: Our assessment will include one site visit to document items whose repair will ready the building for potential reuse by a private developer and subsequent tenant fit-out. Our assessment will include our findings and recommendations, relating to building façade, roofing, ADA accessibility, and lack of vertical transportation. Items that are considered part of the final tenant fit-out, and thus not in this current scope, include HVAC-related upgrades, electrical improvements, kitchen equipment, and plumbing.

#### Phase 2 – Analysis of Putnam Commons Improvements and Amenities

- <u>Objective</u>: The in-depth analysis further studies the opportunities and constraints of the Putnam Commons project. The analysis generates site specific recommendations for the type of improvements.
- <u>Phase Two Milestones:</u>
  - 1. Cost analysis of site-specific improvements and opinion of probable cost for immediate or near term repairs or retrofits required relating to our structural and building envelope analysis that would make the building more "turn-key" to private development and final tenant fit-out.
  - 2. Operational and ongoing maintenance cost estimates based on conventional assumptions for real estate analysis and external data sources, including comparable real estate projects in the general geographic market. Any supplemental information available from the owner that could assist with this analysis, including but not limited to data from other owned real estate projects and/or records from prior tenant conversations should be supplied at the start of the project.

#### Phase 3 – Final Recommendation of Putnam Commons Improvements

- <u>Objective</u>: The final phase considers the comprehensive findings of the previous phases and provides the final report and presentation with recommendations for Putnam Commons.
- <u>Phase Three Deliverables:</u>
  - 1. Final report/prospectus to act as a guide for the Putnam Commons redevelopment, incorporating Phase 1 and 2 milestones. This prospectus will include sufficient information at a reasonable level of detail to describe the use of the proceeds, the total cost of the project, and the anticipated return on investment of the project. Any discovered and notable project risks will be shared, as per good business practice.

#### **Budget**

It is anticipated that the services described above will be approximately **\$25,000.00**. Justification of this amount is based on American Structurepoint's projection of the hours necessary to complete this work for a building of this size. All time spent on the project will be billed using the standard hourly rates indicated in our master service agreement. Reimbursable expenses will be invoiced at cost.

Once project activities begin and should it arise that project costs may exceed \$25,000, Buckeye Hills Regional Council and American Structurepoint will draft a new project proposal justifying the need for additional resources.

# PUTNAM COMMONS BUILDING EVALUATION AND PROSPECTUS

121 Putnam Street, Marietta, Ohio American Structurepoint Project No. 202200371 December 9, 2022



## **PREPARED FOR:**

Buckeye Hills Regional Council c/o Kate Perani 1400 Pike Street Marietta, Ohio 45750

# **PREPARED BY:**

Andy Clemens, PE, SE Project Development Director American Structurepoint Investigative Services

TEL 855 822 1966 WEB www.structurepoint.com

 $\mathbf{f} \mathbf{O} \mathbf{0} \mathbf{n} \mathbf{O}$ 



# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
RECOMMENDATION FOR ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT	1
INTRODUCTION	2
PURPOSE	2
SCOPE OF WORK	2
OPINION OF PROBABLE COST	4
BUILDING ASSESSMENT	5
ARCHITECTURAL SYSTEMS	5
STRUCTURAL SYSTEM	9
ROOFING SYSTEM	16
ACCESSIBILITY & EGRESS	19
FEASIBILITY ANALYSIS	23
INTRODUCTION	23
PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	23
USE NARRATIVES	23
SUPPLEMENTAL TABLE - USES	35
RETAIL/PERSONAL SERVICES	35
DINING	35
ENTERTAINMENT	35
HEALTHCARE	
PROFESSIONAL SERVICES	
Arts, Culture, & Education	36
Сіхіс	
RESIDENTIAL	
MARKET RATE ANALYSIS	37
Nonresidential Buildings	37
RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS	
PROCEDURES, LIMITATIONS, AND ASSUMPTIONS	39
CLOSING COMMENTS	40



# **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Putnam Commons building is a great asset to Marietta, with many possible future uses. This study considered many factors, including condition, size, possible use, and market values, to identify if the building would make economic sense to undertake. The building's structure is in good condition, with few recommendations for repairs. Full replacement of the roofing membranes is recommended for all areas. Many of the wood-framed windows require repair, and storm windows can be installed to improve thermal performance. The elevators have been removed from service, and much of the building is not handicap accessible. The size and location of the building facilitate many possible future uses. A large investment is needed to initiate this project; however, a good rate of return is anticipated.

## RECOMMENDATION FOR ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT

Perform a structural assessment of crushed beam bearing in the basement to determine appropriate repairs if necessary. Until a detailed structural assessment can be performed and any necessary repairs completed, temporary shoring shoud be installed by a qualified shoring contractor at any crushed beam loactions.

Elevator inspections are needed to renew their certificates, and the elevators may require repairs or replacement to accommodate future use.

The building was not evaluated for hazardous materials such as lead paint and asbestos, which may affect the study results. Remediation costs can vary significantly and are difficult to assume and estimate.



# **INTRODUCTION**

#### PURPOSE

The Putnam Commons Building in the City of Marietta, Ohio, is an approximately 60,000square-foot century-old commercial building with a long history as a downtown anchor of local economic activity. Over the years, this building has served as a saddle manufacturing facility, a JC Penney department store, and medical office space. However, the building has been mostly vacant for the past several years and has undergone some ownership challenges. In addition, the block of Putnam Street the Putnam Commons building sits on is underinvested, perhaps due to the long-term vacancy of the Putnam Commons itself. The repurposing of Putnam Commons to productive use is thus critical to the downtown revitalization efforts of the City of Marietta and Washington County.

This study will allow the owner of Putnam Commons to understand the structural needs of the building so that improvements can be made, better market their property to potential tenants, and/or demonstrate the building is worthy of outside investment/development.

#### SCOPE OF WORK

Phase 1 – Analyzing Putnam Commons

- Objective: The analysis will examine the estimated costs of the recommended physical improvements to Putnam Commons.
- Phase One Milestones:
  - Market Analysis: We will collect and analyze market data pertinent to the possible reuse of the structure, focusing on the potential to repay any loans necessary to rehabilitate the property, given reasonable assumptions on financing and public assistance. Rent data will be garnered from external sources and be used to populate a development proforma with a typical 10-year analysis window.
  - 2. Physical assessment of Putnam Commons: Our assessment will include one site visit to document items whose repair will ready the building for potential reuse by a private developer and subsequent tenant fit-out. Our assessment will include findings and recommendations regarding building façade, roofing, ADA accessibility, and lack of vertical transportation. Items considered part of the final tenant fit-out, and thus not in this current scope, include HVAC-related upgrades, electrical improvements, kitchen equipment, and plumbing.

Phase 2 – Analysis of Putnam Commons Improvements and Amenities

AMERICAN

STRUCTUREPOINT

- Objective: The in-depth analysis further studies the opportunities and constraints of the Putnam Commons project. The analysis generates site-specific recommendations for the type of improvements.
- Phase Two Milestones:
  - Cost analysis of site-specific improvements and opinion of probable cost for immediate or near-term repairs or required retrofits related to our structural and building envelope analysis would make the building more "turn-key" to private development and final tenant fit-out.
  - 2. Operational and ongoing maintenance cost estimates based on conventional assumptions for real estate analysis and external data sources, including comparable real estate projects in the general geographic market. Any supplemental information available from the owner that could assist with this analysis, including but not limited to data from other owned real estate projects and/or records from prior tenant conversations, should be supplied at the start of the project.

Phase 3 – Final Recommendation of Putnam Commons Improvements

- Objective: The final phase considers the comprehensive findings of the previous phases and provides the final report and presentation with recommendations for Putnam Commons.
- Phase Three Deliverables:
  - Final report/prospectus to act as a guide for the Putnam Commons redevelopment, incorporating Phase 1 and 2 milestones. This prospectus will include sufficient information at a reasonable level of detail to describe the use of the proceeds, the total cost of the project, and the anticipated return on investment. Any discovered and notable project risks will be shared per good business practice.



# **OPINION OF PROBABLE COST**

The opinion of capital cost listed is for the repair or replacement of visible and accessible building systems and component defects. These costs are based on approximate quantities and values. Not all building areas were accessible and additional repairs may be required. The cost opinions presented in the below schedule are generated from multiple sources, primarily RS Means Cost Data.

These opinions should not be interpreted as a bid or offer to perform the repairs or replacements. The opinions of cost do not address the cost impact of environmentally regulated materials, such as asbestos remediation, on renovation or demolition activities. These opinions should be construed as preliminary, order-of-magnitude budgets. Actual costs will likely vary from the consultant's opinions of cost depending on such matters as type and design of suggested remedy, quality of materials and installation, manufacturer and type of equipment or system selected, field conditions, whether a physical deficiency is repaired or replaced in whole, phasing of work (if applicable), quality of contractor, quality of project management exercised, market conditions, whether competitive pricing is solicited, etc. Qualified professionals should be contacted for quotations concerning each individual system or component.

Building System	Cost
Structural Systems	\$25,000*
Roofing Systems	\$131,000
Architectural Systems	\$737,000
Accessibility & Egress	\$56,000**
TOTAL	\$949,000

\*includes structural assessment to evaluate crushed wood but does not include possible repairs.

\*\*does not include elevator assessment or repair/replacement.

Costs do not include repair or replacement of mechanical or electrical systems, or tenant build out. Costs to renovate tenant spaces is estimated in the Feasibility Analysis section of this report.

# **BUILDING ASSESSMENT**

#### ARCHITECTURAL SYSTEMS

## EXTERIOR ENCLOSURE

The front of the building is clad in stone masonry and painted metal panels. The predominant exterior cladding system for the sides and back of the building consisted of exposed multi-wythe brick masonry. An anodized aluminum storefront system was present on the front of the first story. Many of the windows throughout the building were constructed of single panes in wood frames.

- Paint was flaking from the metal panels.
- The wood-framed windows were generally in poor condition. Many windows were missing glass panes, or the wood frames had deteriorated.
- Four window openings on the first story had been covered in plywood.
- Few isolated areas of the brick masonry had deteriorated mortar and bricks.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Resurface painted metal panels.
- Repair and refinish wood-framed windows and install wood-framed storm windows.
- Replace missing window glass.
- Install new wood-framed windows at the missing first-story window openings.
- Repair deteriorated bricks and tuck point



East elevation



South elevation





Partial west elevation



Partial north elevation



Anodized aluminum storefront system



Partial west elevation



Partial north and west elevations



Anodized aluminum storefront system





Paint flaking from metal panels



Typical window condition



Missing windows



Typical window condition



Typical window condition



Damaged brick masonry





Deteriorated mortar between bricks



Deteriorated mortar between bricks



## STRUCTURAL SYSTEM

The building is comprised of three distinct structural systems that are discussed separately in the following sections, as seen in the image below.



## SIX-STORY STRUCTURE

The six-story portion of the building is believed to be the original structure and is situated behind the four-story structure that fronts Putnam Street. Interior framing consists of two rows of timber post and beam frames. The frames support wood joists and wood plank floor and roof decking. The exterior load-bearing walls consist of multi-wythe brick masonry. A basement below the structure consisted of multi-wythe brick masonry walls and a cast-in-place concrete floor slab.

- Metal beam hangars had corroded in the basement.
- Wood beams had crushed at their supports. See additional assessment recommendations section.
- Staining characteristic of water infiltration through the roof was present on the wood framing throughout the building.
- Minor deterioration of the wood plank decking was present at the water stains.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Immediately cordon off from access and shore any areas exhibiting rotting or crushed wood
- Hire a structural engineer to analyze the crushed wood and repair or replace as necessary. Costs are included in the analysis; however, more accurate repair estimates can only be

STRUCTUREPOINT





determined after an engineer has completed a more detailed analysis beyond this project's scope.

- Replace the roof to eliminate leaks.
- Remove and replace deteriorated wood plank decking during roof repairs.



Typical framing of six-story building



Typical framing of six-story building



Typical framing of six-story building



Typical framing of six-story building





Typical beam and column connection



Overview of basement



Typical beam and column connection



Overview of basement



Corroded metal beam hanger



Crushed wood at support





Typical water stains



Typical water stains



# FOUR-STORY STRUCTURE

The four-story structure consists of a single row of steel columns supporting wood joists, plank floor, and roof decking. The exterior load-bearing walls consist of multi-wythe brick masonry. A basement below the structure consisted of cast-in-place concrete walls and floor slab.

- Prior repairs had been made to the wood roof framing, which consisted of new beams and joists.
- Staining characteristic of water infiltration through the roof was present on the ceiling panels along the west edge of the roof.
- Minor deterioration of the ceiling panels was present at the water stains. The wood plank roof decking was not exposed; however, some deterioration of the decking is presumed.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Replace the roof to eliminate leaks.
- Remove and replace deteriorated any wood plank decking during roof repairs.



Typical framing of four-story building



Typical framing of four-story building





Overview of basement



Overview of basement



Prior structural repairs on roof



Water-stained ceiling panels



## THREE-STORY STRUCTURE

The three-story structure appeared to be primarily constructed of wood floor and roof joists that span between concrete masonry unit (CMU) walls and the brick masonry walls of the adjacent structure. A basement below the structure consisted of cast-in-place concrete walls and floor slab.

• Water stains and deteriorated wall finishes were observed at several locations on the third and second stories, where roof leaks dripped from above.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Replace the roof to eliminate leaks.
- Remove and replace deteriorated any wood plank decking during roof repairs.



Overview of structure



Stained ceiling and deteriorated roof framing



Stained third-story ceiling



Stained second-story ceiling



## **ROOFING SYSTEM**

## UPPER AND MIDDLE ROOFS

The upper and middle roofs consisted of a modified bitumen (Mod-Bit) roofing system. The upper roof was inaccessible during the assessment because of a locked roof hatch but is believed to be the same type of roofing system, age, and condition as the middle roof. The middle roof sloped from the high side along the east roof edge to the low side along the east wall of the upper stories. Stormwater from the middle roof flows to a scupper located along the base of the east wall. The roof was in fair-to-poor condition, with "alligator" cracking at the asphalt coatings throughout.

- Dirt and debris had collected along the low edge of the roof, against the upper stories, and in an area above water leaks in the room below.
- Spray foam insulation had been applied along the "inside" face of the parapets, which were unprotected and deteriorating.
- The top of the brick parapets along the roof edges was coated in a cementitious parge coating. The coating was cracked and deteriorated; remedial sealant was present in some locations.
- An ethylene propylene diene monomer (EPDM) lined gutter was located along the east roof edge. The drain was clogged, and the gutter had filled with water. The stone coping along the edge of the gutter had spalled where the fasteners for the membrane attached.
- The tops of several apparently obsolete chimneys were open.
- The upper roof drained to a single scupper located at the base of the upper stories. The scupper appeared to be undersized and was not provided with a debris screen.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Remove and replace the mod-bit roofs of the upper and middle roofs.
- Remove the spray-foam insulation along the parapet walls and install new protected insulation if necessary.
- Install new light-gauge metal coping over the cracked parge coating of the parapets for the middle roof and assumed for the upper roof.
- Remove obstruction from the east gutter, and install drain with debris screen and/or overflow drain.
- Cover open chimneys to prevent water infiltration.



Reconfigure the roof drain to provide an appropriately sized drain with debris screens and • emergency (secondary) overflow drain.



Overview of middle roof



Low roof side of middle roof









Typical condition of the middle roof







Dirt and debris on roof above leak



Deteriorated cement parge coating along top of parapet



Typical open chimney

# Exposed spray-foam insulation along parapet



Clogged EPDM-lined gutter



Single scupper at base of upper story wall

# LOWER ROOF

The lower roof consisted of a thermoplastic roofing system. The roof sloped from its high side along the east roof edge, to its low side along the west roof edge. Precipitation flows to a gutter and downspouts located along the west roof edge.

- Several large patched repairs above leaks below.
- Metal flashing had come loose from behind metal coping along a portion of a parapet.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

• Remove and replace the thermoplastic roofing and reinstall flashing as needed.



As discussed in the structural section, replace deteriorated wood plank roof decking when the roof is replaced.



Overview of lower roof



Large patch repair



Large patch repair



Loose metal flashing

## **ACCESSIBILITY & EGRESS**

#### **BUILDING INTERIOR**

Several accessible pathways throughout much of the building generally comply with current accessibility standards. The first story of the building is split between two elevations. The main lobby is located on a lower elevation than the west portion of the building. The building contains two elevators.

The elevator located in the main lobby is a typical passenger elevator that serves stories one through four and does not provide access to the basement or stories five or six. This elevator provides accessibility throughout much of the building and is conveniently located for people



entering the building from Putman Street. The elevator serves both the upper and lower sides of the first story.

The elevator located at the southwest corner of the building is a large service elevator that serves all stories of the building and the basement. This elevator would provide accessibility throughout the building if it were brought into operation; however, it is located in the far corner of the building, which is inconvenient for people entering from the building from Putman Street.

Several staircases are located throughout the building that provides access to various areas. A single staircase in the west portion of the building provided access to stories one through six and is the only access for stories five and six. A modern staircase is located on the backside of the building that provides access to the first, second, and third stories. A staircase was located at the northeast corner of the building, providing access from the basement to the third story of the north portion. An additional staircase was located off the main lobby, providing access to the second story.

- The passenger elevator was last inspected in December 2014, as indicated on a sticker on the motor; however, it was unclear if the elevator was operational. Based on permit information obtained from the Ohio Elevator database, the elevator was removed from service when annual inspections could not be performed. Repairs or replacements may be needed to bring the elevator back into service.
- The elevator room for the service elevator could not be accessed during the assessment. Based on permit information obtained from the Ohio Elevator database, the elevator was removed from service when an annual inspection could not be performed. Repairs or replacements may be needed to bring the elevator back into service.
- Stories five and six are not ADA accessible.
- The staircase in the west portion of the building is narrow, in poor condition, and does not meet current dimensional requirements.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. Inspect both elevators to determine necessary repairs and upgrades. Costs for repair or replacement can be determined after inspection.
- No accessible access is provided to stories five or six. Extending the main passenger elevator or replacing the service elevator may be desired to provide accessibility to the upper stories. This option requires consultation with an elevator contractor to evaluate the existing equipment, and no costs are provided for this recommendation.
- 3. Replace the current staircase in the west portion of the building to meet current standards.

AMERICAN

STRUCTUREPOINT







Service elevator at an upper story



Lobby, stairs to elevated first story, and elevator



Main elevator at elevated first story



Service elevator in the basement



Main elevator in lobby



Typical wood stairs





Typical wood stairs



Typical wood stairs



# FEASIBILITY ANALYSIS

#### INTRODUCTION

This section describes the possible reuses for Putnam Commons. Beginning with a discussion of the potential use categories, the financial evaluation methodology is then described, followed by a site evaluation.

Location Significance	W Putnam Street near OH-7 / Ohio River Scenic Byway
On-Site Amenities	Building facades in good condition Neighboring storefronts are attractive and have tenants
Surrounding Amenities	Over 25 locally owned restaurants Muskingum and Ohio Rivers Campus Martius and Ohio River Museums People's Bank Theater & The Adelphia Music Hall Marietta College, Peoples Bank, and Memorial Health Systems
Potential Obstacles	No dedicated parking lot Necessary repairs could be off-putting to potential tenants

#### PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

#### Analysis:

The proforma estimated a total project cost of \$1,554,000, with an equity investment of \$804,000 yielding a net present value (NPV) after ten years of \$1,209,979 and an internal rate of return (IRR) of 21.56 percent. The equity amount was determined by applying a reasonable loan-to-value ratio (75%) for the building's post-project value (estimated at \$1,000,000) and subtracting that amount from the total project cost. The required equity may prove an impediment to finding a suitable buyer, and a public subsidy may be required to make the project feasible.

#### **USE NARRATIVES**

The 2019 pandemic made many aware of the importance of their health while it wasn't safe to go to the gym. That led to a rise in the "green exercise" movement, where people are choosing to get their exercise outdoors instead of indoors. Interest in hiking is now at an all-time high,



and the popularity of other outdoor activities, such as cycling and running, has increased as well.<sup>1</sup>

8.1 million more Americans went hiking in 2020 compared to 2019, according to the Outdoor Foundation, the philanthropic wing of the Outdoor Industry Association. 7.9 million more went camping in 2020 than the year before, and 3.4 million more participated in freshwater fishing. Overall, inactivity declined for most age groups and across all income levels. There was a 52.9% surge in outdoor participation, an increase from 50.5% in 2018 and 50.7% in 2019.<sup>2</sup>

The increase in outdoor activities can be a positive for Marietta since it is both a college town and a gateway into Appalachia. A focus on outdoor recreation can create new jobs in businesses that rent out bicycles and other gear, sell camping equipment, or offer excursions. To further serve tourists and residents alike, support businesses such as coffee shops, restaurants, and urgent care centers. Since Marietta already has a great downtown, a beautiful college campus, and outdoor resources, the city can draw in visitors and supply employment to residents with this new diversity of businesses and some directed marketing.

## Retail<sup>2</sup>

The COVID-19 pandemic changed how retailers of all sizes had to operate. While retailers are still an essential part of any town's economy, allowing for a more diverse set of retail spaces will help Marietta stay resilient throughout the ebbs and flows of the economy. Examples of diverse retailers include bike shops (see Figure 1), print-on-demand and shipping, and day spas. Other ways to bolster retail storefronts are to add new bike racks, bike lanes, and benches, hold special events where the retailers stay open longer, and create new business incubators that include retail shops.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> <u>https://fortune.com/2021/12/19/green-exercise-hiking-cycling-outdoor-workouts/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>https://www.dailysabah.com/life/health/outdoor-activities-boom-in-us-amid-covid-19-pandemic</u>



Figure 1 - An example of a local bicycle dealer. The upper floors of the building are condominiums. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Boutique clothing, vintage shop, record store, jewelers Upper floors n/a
	Four-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors
	Drop-shipping, hardware store, bookstore, phone retailer, toy store,
	laundromat/dry cleaner
	Upper floors n/a
	Three-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> floor
	Florist/plant shop, stationery, print-on-demand, paint your own pottery,
	home décor
	Upper floors
	n/a



## Dining<sup>3</sup>

In the wake of COVID-19, perhaps no other type of business changed as much as restaurants and bars. The industry pivoted to delivery and take-out services, new menus, and outdoor dining to keep its doors open (see Figure 2). Regulatory flexibility will be essential so restaurants can continue to operate and protect public health in the future. Ways to support the dining industry include free public events, performances, and activities. Welcoming immigrant communities can lead to the opening of a wide variety of dining options. To bolster late-night dining services and keep everyone safe, towns could encourage residents to become rideshare drivers, utilize ridesharing, or both.



Figure 2 - A vegan/GF bakery offers dine-in or take-out options and catering services. The upper floors of the building include rental apartments. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Café, catering, shared kitchen
	Upper floors n/a
	Four-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Restaurant/bar, bakery, indoor farmer's market, distillery
	Upper floors n/a



Three-story structure – 1st floor Café, juice bar, ice cream shop
Upper floors n/a

#### Entertainment

Entertainment options serve as a draw for customers beyond typical business hours and help add to the local economy. Entertainment options rising in popularity are innovative businesses like bars with ax throwing, cat cafes that house rescue organizations, and arcades that include indoor mini-golf (see Figure 2). To keep residents healthy, there is now also a focus on social distancing while enjoying entertainment options. To get people outside, towns need to change the purpose of public space. Currently, most public space nationwide is dedicated to parking, not parks.<sup>4</sup> Parks can even be small "pocket parks" and still provide a valuable outdoor space for local businesses to use. Pocket within Marietta would greatly complement the vast outdoor resources available in the area for when residents want to enjoy being outside but engage in more "passive" recreation choices.



Figure 3 - An entertainment venue that includes dining, video games, and mini-golf with an IT firm located on the upper floors. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Arcade, cat café Upper floors Hotel
	Four-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Ax throwing, craft brewery, indoor mini-golf Upper floors Hotel
	Three-story structure – 1st floor Arcade, cat café, craft brewery Upper floors Hotel

## Healthcare

Healthcare has come to mean many things in recent years. For some, healthcare is access to affordable and quick services such as urgent care facilities and doctor's clinics. For others, it is a safe community where seniors can live or where children grow in an educational setting while their parents are at work (see Figure 4). And in many neighborhoods, residents need access to fresh and healthy foods in a convenient location, such as a local greengrocer. All these needs can be met in a small-town environment. Town centers can be ideal for these businesses because they are centrally located, have ample parking, and allow users to be integrated into a vibrant part of their town's social life.





Figure 4 - A former downtown hotel now houses a senior living facility. The first floor contains several co-working and shared meeting spaces. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Pilates studio, doctor's offices, chiropractor's offices, personal trainer, dispensaries, daycare Upper floors Senior living
	Four-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Yoga studio, pharmacy, veterinarian's office, gym, clinic/urgent care, martial arts studio, dispensary Upper floors Senior living
	Three-story structure – 1st floor Pharmacy, martial arts studio, dispensary, doctor's offices, chiropractor's offices Upper floors Senior living



## **Professional Services**

Professional and consulting services are ideally suited for small-town environments (see Figure 5). They are often quiet, with a steady flow of customers, and do not need an excessive amount of parking. Employees of those businesses can frequent each other, such as the insurance agent who eats lunch at the local deli and picks up their dry cleaning on the way home. These businesses also attract visitors who may visit several offices and shops during one trip to the area. Lastly, professional offices often do not require renovations to existing buildings as extensive as other uses like restaurants. The rise in demand for business incubators and coworking spaces could be met in the available storefronts in Marietta, and perhaps including the first floor of Putnam Commons. Other more modern businesses include pet grooming, technology repair, and – while historically shunned in many downtowns but now making inroads – tattoo studios.



Figure 5 - An attorney's office occupies this historic building's first floor while rental apartments are above. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.



Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Financial adviser, insurance agent, IT consulting, tech repairs, consulting office, co-working space, career/life coaching, photography studio, tattoo studio, event planning, tax services, architecture & interiors, pet grooming, house cleaning, attorney, virtual assistant Upper floors Hotel
	Four-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Financial adviser, salon/barber, banking, insurance agent, IT consulting, tech repair, consulting office, travel agent, marketing/PR, tattoo studio, real estate office, event planning, tax services, architecture & interiors, construction services, attorney Upper floors Hotel
	Three-story structure – 1st floor Financial adviser, salon/barber, banking, insurance agent, IT consulting, tech repair, consulting office, travel agent, marketing/PR, tattoo studio, real estate office, event planning, tax services, architecture & interiors, construction services, attorney Upper floors Short-term rentals, Airbnb/VRBO

## Arts, Culture, & Education

COVID-19 put a temporary damper on the rapid growth of the arts, culture, and education industries, but they are experiencing a comeback. Town centers have traditionally housed art galleries, museums, and libraries, which will continue to be needed in the future for the cultural enrichment of our communities (see Figure 6). Another art and education industry member that has taken off is "makerspaces," where the public can access shared tools and technology to create and sell their innovations. Related to makerspaces are trade school annexes, shared kitchen facilities for caterers, artist collectives and residencies, craft events, and pop-up art installations.



Figure 6 - A framing shop on the same block as the local civic theater hosts an art gallery with residences on its upper floor. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Trade school annex, craft collective, tutoring Upper floors Makerspace, artist's collective/residency, museum
	Four-story – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Library annex, art gallery Upper floors Makerspace, artist's collective/residency, museum
	Three-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Library annex, art gallery Upper floors Makerspace, artist's collective/residency, museum

#### Civic

Locating civic uses and public spaces downtown increases accessibility, thereby increasing the foot traffic that keeps the area lively and growing. As cities recover from the pandemic, they can help confront challenges, such as economic and environmental challenges, while investing in the future. One way to do that is to invest in public spaces. When municipalities



implement <u>changes</u> that make their streets, sidewalks, and other public spaces more equitable, inclusive, and accessible, they experience benefits such as decreased crime and increased tax revenues.<sup>5</sup> Civic functions well-suited to downtown locations are visitors' bureaus, municipal office annexes, "cop shops," and outposts for local political representatives (see Figure 7).



Figure 7 - Residences in a historic building are above a local visitor's bureau and construction company office. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.

Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Municipal office annex, political representative's local office Upper floors n/a
	Four-story – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Municipal office annex, political representative's local office, cop shop, community center Upper floors n/a
	Three-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors Municipal office annex, political representative's local office, cop shop, community center Upper floors n/a



#### Residential

"Residential infill development" is when new housing is located on vacant or underutilized land in previously developed areas, such as town centers.<sup>6</sup> Residential units are ideal for the upper stories of existing buildings. The unique size and character of these buildings can allow for various housing types to be in the more dense and walkable environments that are in demand from residents of all ages (see Figure 8). While the young may be attracted to the area's restaurants and shopping, the middle-aged may like the convenience of living near their job, and seniors may appreciate access to their social network and local services. Some towns may also discover an unmet need for short-term and vacation rentals, and residential units near outdoor recreation are perfect ways to meet those needs.



Figure 8 - Historic structures can provide opportunities for unique residential units. Image: Kyle Johnson, Orange Door Creative.



Potential Reuse Examples	Six-story structure – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors n/a Upper floors Multi-unit residential, short-term rentals, Airbnb/VRBO
	Four-story – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors n/a Upper floors Multi-unit residential, short-term rentals, Airbnb/VRBO
	Three-story – 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> floors n/a Upper floors Multi-unit residential, short-term rentals, Airbnb/VRBO

# SUPPLEMENTAL TABLE - USES

General reuse categories include retail, dining, entertainment, healthcare, professional services, arts, culture, education, civic, and residential. Detailed examples of each general use are listed below and are assumed to be part of a mixed-use environment.

## **RETAIL/PERSONAL SERVICES**

- Boutique clothing
- Florist / Plants
- Paint your own pottery
- Home décor
- Vintage shop

- Record shop
- Bookstore
- Phone retailer
- Jewelers
- Toy store
  - Bike shop
- Drop-shipping

# Stationery

.

- Laundromat or
  Dry cleaner
- Hardware store
- Print-ondemand and/or shipping

## DINING

- Distillery
- Restaurant / Bar
- Café

# ENTERTAINMENT

- Ax throwing
- Craft brewery

- Bakery
- Juice bar
- Catering

- Shared kitchen
- Ice cream shop
- Farmer's Market

- Indoor mini-golf
- Arcade

- Cat café
- Hotel

## **HFAI THCARF**

- Yoga studio
- Pilates studio
- Doctor's office
- Chiropractor's office

- Pharmacy
- Veterinarian's office
- Gym
- Personal trainer

- Senior center
- Clinic / Urgent care
- Martial arts studio
- Dispensaries •
- Daycare •

## **PROFESSIONAL SERVICES**

- Financial adviser
- Hair/nail salon or barber
- Banking
- Insurance agent
- IT consulting
- Tech repair
- Consulting office
- Travel agent
- Co-working space

## ARTS, CULTURE, & EDUCATION

- Trade school annex
- Library annex
- Library annex makerspace

coaching Photography studio •

• Career/life

- Marketing / PR • Tattoo studio •
- Real estate office •
- Event planning
- Attorney
- Tax services •
- Makerspace •
- Artist's collective / residency / studio
- Craft collective

- Architecture & interiors
- Bed & breakfast
- Hospitality
- Pet grooming
- House cleaning
- Construction services
- Virtual assistant
- Tutoring
- Art gallery
- Museum

#### CIVIC

- Visitor's Bureau
- Municipal office annex
- Cop shop

- representative's local office

#### RESIDENTIAL

- Multi-unit apartment complex
- Short-term rentals
- Airbnb/VRBO



- Political
- Community center

# MARKET RATE ANALYSIS

A rental market analysis was conducted by comparing listings for buildings of similar use nearby.

# NONRESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS

Link	Location	Use	Condition/ Building Class	Size	Rate
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/476-480- Richland-Ave-Athens- OH/20434171/	Athens	Commercial	C	16,000 SF	\$2.91 / SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/302-29th-St- Vienna-WV/24984496/	Vienna, WV	Retail	С	1,620 SF	\$93 per SF
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/23-3rd-St-Malta- OH/18272682/	Malta	Retail	С	14,454 SF	\$14 per SF
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/183-W-Main-St- Saint-Clairsville- OH/19829558/	Saint Clairsville	Office	С	920 SF	\$12.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/121-E-Main-St- Saint-Clairsville- OH/21858125/	Saint Clairsville	Office	В	1,920 SF	\$12.50 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/149-Acme-St- Marietta-OH/23553078/	Marietta	Office	В	2,135 SF	\$12.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/51710-National- Rd-E-Saint-Clairsville- OH/18278317/	Saint Clairsville	Retail	N/A	3,152.5 SF	\$14.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/70-N-Plains-Rd- The-Plains-OH/16686785/	The Plains	Retail	N/A	1,440 SF	\$7.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/65268-Norris-Rd- Lore-City-OH/24276071/	Lore City	Retail	N/A	1,200 SF	\$10.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/27425-State- Route-7-Marietta- OH/23550215/	Marietta	Flex	N/A	4,100 SF	\$11.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/47445-National- Rd-Saint-Clairsville- OH/24340596/	Saint Clairsville	Flex	Full Build-Out	3,975 SF	\$12.00 /SF/YR
https://www.loopnet.com /Listing/1416-Fairview- Rd-Zanesville- OH/23639357/	Zanesville	Flex	N/A	7,128 SF	\$7.07 /SF/YR

Source: loopnet.com

## RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS

Link	Location	Use	Building Type	SF per Unit	Rent (monthly)
https://www.apartments.com/2006- ravenswood-rd-ravenswood-wv/m6fm9mh/	Ravenswood, WV	Residential	Single- Family detached	900	\$570
https://www.apartments.com/186-w- washington-st-athens-oh/xxj7tmn/	Athens	Residential	Single- Family detached	890	\$550
https://www.apartments.com/6-brown-ave- athens-oh/ezvqr8m/	Athens	Residential	Single- Family detached	1,344	\$475
https://www.apartments.com/115-n-lancaster- st-athens-oh/5vbzwfg/	Athens	Residential	Single- Family detached	1,444	\$435
https://www.apartments.com/14-1st-st-athens- oh/evcqw8q/	Athens	Residential	Single- Family detached	950	\$400
https://www.apartments.com/valley-greene- barnesville-oh/y43q76v/	Barnesville	Residential	Multi- Family	1,010	\$556
https://www.apartments.com/3-br-3-bath- house-404-vaught-rd-whipple-oh/6rf0grs/	Whipple	Residential	Single- Family detached	1,752	\$1,600
https://www.apartments.com/the-grove- belmont-oh/r2r3lh3/	Belmont	Residential	Multi- Family	950	\$1,200
https://www.apartments.com/clover-ridge- senior-living-mcconnelsville-oh/8y91nr2/	McConnelsville	Residential	Single- Family Attached	1,367	\$687
https://www.apartments.com/taylor-place- crooksville-crooksville-oh/n669njg/	Crooksville	Residential	Multi- Family	676	\$515
https://www.apartments.com/1527-foster-ave- cambridge-oh/0l2kcm2/	Cambridge	Residential	Multi- Family	1,000	\$950

Sources: apartments.com

# PROCEDURES, LIMITATIONS, AND ASSUMPTIONS

American Structurepoint, Inc. conducted on-site evaluations of the properties to determine their condition as outlined above. We did not gain access to all areas, operate equipment, or perform any tests during our visit. The findings in our report are not based on a comprehensive engineering study, as we did not remove building materials to inspect the underlying structure, systems, or assemblies.

This report does not confirm the absence of asbestos, PCBs, toxic soils, mold, or other hazardous materials. If certification of these items is required, we recommend specialists in these areas be retained for detailed investigation and testing.

The assessment firm assumes no responsibility for any legal matters. It is assumed that the facility surveyed is controlled by the property representatives interviewed, and information thus gained regarding ownership, location, condition, etc., is factual.

All maps, descriptive materials, and data furnished to the assessment firm are assumed to be correct and adequate for inclusion in this report. Estimates and opinions furnished to the assessment firm by informed persons are assumed to be accurate and reasonable. This report is the client's property and will be used in connection with the purchase of the property. No other use is allowed without the written consent of the author.

Estimates of values contained herein for deferred maintenance, latent defects, upgrades, etc. (if any) are the opinions of the assessment firm, which assumes no liability for errors, facts, or judgments.

The assessment firm does not warrant their investigation has revealed all items of deferred maintenance, latent defects, etc., that exist within the project. The assessment firm does state; however, they have made a "best effort" to identify such items in the time available at the project site as they are consistent with their experience in the architectural and engineering business.

# **CLOSING COMMENTS**

American Structurepoint would be pleased to advise and assist with any questions regarding any of our recommendations. Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Very Truly Yours,

American Structurepoint, Inc.,

1 dan ens

Andy Clemens, PE, SE Project Development Director Investigative Services